Quality Assurance and Qualifications Frameworks for Higher Education at national and EHEA-level

Dr. Mark Frederiks
Conference "Reforming European Higher Education - From Policy to Practice"
8 June 2018, Kiev
Qualifications frameworks in EHEA (Bologna process)

• Ministers Communiqué London 2007: “Qualifications frameworks are important instruments in achieving comparability and transparency within the EHEA and facilitating the movement of learners within, as well as between, higher education systems. They should also help HEIs to develop modules and study programmes based on learning outcomes and credits, and improve the recognition of qualifications as well as all forms of prior learning.”
Qualifications Frameworks

• Overarching European Qualification Framework for the EHEA
  o 3 cycles+: short (*Paris Communique*), 1st (BA), 2nd (MA), 3rd (PhD)
  o Generic descriptors for each cycle (Dublin descriptors)
  o Credits ranges, ECTS (work load 25-30 hours; for 3rd cycle ECTS not specified); ECTS Users Guide 2015
  o Development of National Qualifications Frameworks (NQFs)
  o Certification of NQFs to ensure that NQFs are in line with European framework

• EU framework for lifelong learning (EQF) has 8 levels
  o levels 5-8 equivalent to EHEA short, 1st, 2nd, 3rd cycles
Qualifications frameworks in EHEA (cont.)

• Ministers Communiqué Leuven/Louvain-la-Neuve 2009: “The development of national qualifications frameworks is an important step towards the implementation of lifelong learning. We aim at having them implemented and prepared for self-certification against the overarching Qualifications Framework for the EHEA by 2012. This will require continued coordination at the level of the EHEA and with the European Qualifications Framework for Lifelong Learning.”
Qualification Frameworks: example  Netherlands

3rd cycle
(level 8)

2nd cycle
(level 7)

1st cycle
(level 6)
(level 5)

Bachelor's programme (professional orientation)
- min. 60 ECTS -
240 ECTS
- Associate degree
120 ECTS

Master's programme (professional orientation)
- min. 60 ECTS

Master's programme (academic orientation)
- min. 60 ECTS

Bachelor's programme (academic orientation)
- 180 ECTS

Doctorate
+/-4 years
- Design Engineer
- Medical Specialist

Secondary education 6y
5 y
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>qualification</th>
<th>Bachelor's programmes with a professional orientation</th>
<th>Dublin descriptor</th>
<th>EQF descriptor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Level 6</td>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>minimum 180 credits</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Bachelor's programmes with a professional orientation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>general</th>
<th>specific</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professional orientation implies that the programmes are aimed at bringing students to a level of general and specific knowledge and competences, based upon the application of scientific or artistic knowledge, creativity and practical knowledge.</td>
<td>general competences such as the capacity for logical thought and reasoning, the ability to acquire and process information, the ability for critical reflection and project-based work, creativity, the ability to perform simple supervision tasks, the ability to communicate information, ideas, problems and solutions to both specialists as well as laymen, and a positive attitude towards lifelong learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor's programmes with a professional orientation aim to bring students to the level of general and specific knowledge and competences that are needed for the independent practice of a profession or a cluster of professions.</td>
<td>specific professional competences at the level of a newly-qualified professional.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor's programmes with an academic orientation aim to bring students to the level of knowledge and competences that are needed for scientific or artistic functions in general and specifically, with an aim to the minor's programme.</td>
<td>academic orientation implies that the programmes are aimed at bringing the students to a level of general knowledge and the acquisition of academic or artistic knowledge and competences, based upon the application of scientific or artistic knowledge, creativity and knowledge.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dublin descriptor**

- have demonstrated knowledge and understanding in a field of study that builds upon their general secondary education, and is typically at a level that, whilst supported by advanced textbooks, includes some aspects that will be informed by knowledge at the forefront of their field of study.
- can apply their knowledge and understanding in a manner that indicates a professional approach to their work, or vocation, and has competences typically demonstrated through devising and sustaining arguments and solving problems within their field of study.

**EQF descriptor**

- have the ability to gather and interpret relevant data (usually within their field of study) to inform judgments that include reflection on relevant social, scientific or ethical issues.
- can communicate information, ideas, problems and solutions to both specialist and non-specialist audiences.
- have developed those learning skills that are necessary for them to continue to undertake further study with a high degree of autonomy.
- take responsibility for managing professional developments of individuals and groups.
- manage complex technical or professional activities or projects, taking responsibility for decision-making in unpredictable work or study contexts.

**Knowledge**

- advanced knowledge of a field of work or study, involving a critical understanding of theories and principles.

**Skills**

- advanced skills, demonstrating mastery and innovation, required to solve complex and unpredictable problems in a specialized field of work or study.

**Competence**

- take responsibility for managing professional developments of individuals and groups.
Overall progress NQFs (2017, Cedefop)

- **35 countries** have officially established or formally adopted their national qualifications frameworks (NQFs); **4 countries** are still working on the design and/or the formal adoption of their NQFs;

- **Cedefop considers 21 NQFs to have reached operational status:** Austria, Belgium (FL), Czech Republic (partial framework for vocational qualifications - NSK), Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Ireland, Latvia, Lithuania, Liechtenstein, Luxembourg, Malta, the Netherlands, Norway, Portugal, Slovenia, Sweden, Switzerland and the UK.

- **35 countries are working towards comprehensive NQFs** covering all types and levels of qualification from formal education and training (VET, HE, general education); and increasingly opening towards qualifications awarded outside formal education and training (e.g. Austria, Netherlands, Poland, Slovenia, Sweden)

- **35 countries had formally linked (‘referenced’) their national qualifications frameworks to the EQF:** Austria, Belgium (Flanders and Wallonia), Bulgaria, Croatia, Cyprus, the Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, France, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, Ireland, Italy, Kosovo, Latvia, Lichtenstein, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malta, Montenegro, the Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey and the United Kingdom (England, Scotland and Wales). The remaining countries are expected to follow in 2018, which means that the first stage of EQF referencing is nearly finished.

- **29 countries** participating in the EQF implementation have also self-certified their framework against the Bologna framework (QF-EHEA), 20 jointly with the EQF referencing.
Learning outcomes

• “Bologna” definition (for EHEA)
  “statements of what a learner is expected to know, understand and/or be able to do at the end of a period of learning.”
  (Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area, p. 29)

“Be able to do”
  → This implies: achievable and assessable

“A period of learning”
  → This can be a course, module, programme, ...
Relevance of Learning Outcomes

• Direct window on what a programme wants to achieve
• Facilitates international comparability
• Open to other developments in HE
  o E-learning
  o Prior Experiential Learning / Acquired Competences
• Recognition of degrees
  o Diploma supplement (includes programme learning outcomes)
• Learning outcomes-curriculum-assessment
• Student-centred learning (ESG 1.3)
• Assessed in QA/accreditation procedures
  o Intended and achieved learning outcomes
From Teacher-Centred to Student-Centred (1/3)

- Vision on curriculum design
  - T-C: ... starts from the content of the courses/modules
  - S-C: ... starts with the intended result, the anticipated achievements of the students.

- Vision on teaching activities
  - T-C: What do I want/have to teach?
  - S-C: What do the students need to know, understand and be able to demonstrate (in my discipline, in the professional field, on the labour market)?
From Teacher-Centred to Student-Centred (2/3)

- **Vision on the educational process**
  - T-C: ... is expressed and calculated in workload and measures of time (hours, semesters, years)
  - S-C: ... is expressed in credits that combine workload and learning outcomes

- **Vision on the degree**
  - T-C: ... proves participation and successful completion of a programme.
  - S-C: ... is proof of achieved learning outcomes (“a master in a discipline”).
From Teacher-Centred to Student-Centred (3/3)

- Vision on the recognition of foreign degrees
  - T-C: What did you have to do to get your degree (courses, years, ...)?
  - S-C: What do you know and can you do (your achieved learning outcomes)?
How to write learning outcomes?

• Focus on what you expect students to be able to demonstrate upon completion of the module or programme
• Start each outcome with an active verb: e.g. know, understand, learn, be familiar with, be exposed to, be acquainted with, be aware of
• Should be simply and clearly described
• Should be student-focused rather than teacher-focused
• Needs to be associated with workload (credits)
• Needs to be obtainable, measureable and validly assessed
• 5–8 learning outcomes per module
• Link module LOs to programme LOs
### Assessing learning outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programme</th>
<th>Module x</th>
<th>Module y</th>
<th>Module z</th>
<th>...</th>
<th>Achieved?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intended LOs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Achieved?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intended LOs</td>
<td>❌</td>
<td>❌</td>
<td>❌</td>
<td></td>
<td>Achieved?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intended LOs</td>
<td>❌</td>
<td></td>
<td>❌</td>
<td></td>
<td>Achieved?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOs</td>
<td>LOs</td>
<td>LOs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment</td>
<td>Assessment</td>
<td>Assessment</td>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ECTS Course catalogue**
Recognition of degrees

Qualification
Master of Science in Engineering
UNIXYZ

Learning outcomes
- ...
- ...
- ...

External QA

QA Agency

EQAR
ESG Part 1. Standards and guidelines for internal quality assurance

1.1 Policy for quality assurance
1.2 Design and approval of programmes
1.3 Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment
1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification
1.5 Teaching staff
1.6 Learning resources and student support
1.7 Information management
1.8 Public information
1.9 On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes
1.10 Cyclical external quality assurance
ESG 1.4 Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

**Standard:**

Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student “life cycle”, e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.
Conclusion

• QFs, LOs, QA and recognition are all interlinked and interdependent
• Student-centered learning approach has a significant impact on QA
• Intended and achieved learning outcomes
• Student assessment methods in line with intended LOs
• LOs linking pin between ECTS, Diploma Supplement, recognition, Qualification Frameworks, QA
Thank you very much!

m.frederiks@nvao.net

NVAO
Accreditation Organisation of The Netherlands and Flanders

info@nvao.net
www.nvao.net

@nvao